

Queensland



Parliamentary Debates  
[Hansard]

**Legislative Council**

**TUESDAY, 17 AUGUST 1869**

---

Electronic reproduction of original hardcopy

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Tuesday, 17 August, 1869.*

Manning's Retirement Bill.—Treasury Bills Bill.—Woogaroo Lunatic Asylum.

## MANNING'S RETIREMENT BILL.

The POSTMASTER-GENERAL moved the second reading of a "Bill to provide for the retirement of Arthur Wilcox Manning, Esquire, from the public service of Queensland upon special allowance." He said honorable members were, no doubt, conversant with the circumstances of the case. Mr. Manning had, for a number of years, held a high position in the Civil Service of this colony; and in the performance of his duties as Under Colonial Secretary, had been assaulted by another member of the Civil Service, who appeared to have conceived some grudge against him. This person, who had inflicted grievous injury upon Mr. Manning, was now suffering the penalty for his great crime. Unfortunately the assault was of such a serious character as to affect Mr. Manning's prospects for life; and there was very little probability that this gentleman would be restored to anything like his previous state of health, and he would cer-

tainly be unable to perform any public duties for the future. Under these circumstances, and in view of the fact that Mr. Manning received these injuries in discharge of his public duties, it was considered by the Government that some compensation should be made to him. A very liberal and generous allowance was provided for him in the Bill before the House. Mr. Manning had been looked up to as an able and conscientious civil servant: he had been for a number of years in the service of this colony and that of the neighboring colony of New South Wales, and he was well-known, and invariably respected in the discharge of his duties. He was quite sure the Legislative Council would appreciate the liberal recognition of Mr. Manning's services shown by this Bill. While they must deplore the unfortunate occurrence which had caused that gentleman's retirement from active service, it became their duty to provide for him under such melancholy circumstances. Further provision was made in the event of his death; and his widow would be entitled, as long as she lived, to a payment at the rate of £300 a year. In calling attention to the fact that the provisions of this Bill were far in excess of the allowance provided under the Civil Service Act, he would point out that in this case the circumstances were wholly exceptional, and it was to be hoped such cases would be of rare occurrence. He felt quite confident to leave the Bill in the hands of honorable members, being sure that they were desirous of recognizing the claims which Mr. Manning had upon the public in consequence of the terrible injuries he had received from the assault made upon him while in discharge of his public duties.

The Hon. E. I. C. BROWNE said he did not rise with the slightest intention of opposing this Bill, because he was fully of opinion that it was a very proper one. Taking all the circumstances into consideration, he thought it was only right, and he considered it was the duty of the colony, to provide for a servant who had been so fearfully assaulted in the discharge of his duties. He only rose for the purpose of pointing out to the honorable member, and for the consideration of the House and the Legislature generally, that it was desirable to frame the Bill in accordance with usage and ordinary grammatical construction—at all events, in such terms as would bring the facts it embodied within the understanding of the reader. He had never read a more involved statement than that which was comprised in the second recital;—it was a disgrace to the person who framed it, and would be a disgraceful production for a boy of ten years old.

The question was put and passed, and the Bill was read a second time.

#### TREASURY BILLS BILL.

The POSTMASTER-GENERAL in moving that the House be put into Committee of the

Whole, for the purpose of considering the Treasury Bills Bill, said his attention had been called by an honorable member opposite, Mr. Bramston, to the fact, that whereas £300,000 worth of Treasury bills would fall due at the end of the present year, the Bill provided for the issue of £350,000 worth to meet that liability. He would point out, in explanation, that the Colonial Treasurer, in his financial statement, had shown an excess of expenditure, for the current year, of £349,309. It was conceived that it would not be good financial policy to issue long-dated debentures for this indebtedness, but that these bills should be met by payments extending over three years out of the current revenue. £350,000 of Treasury bills represented the amount of indebtedness in excess of the current expenditure. It was true that only £300,000 would be required to meet the Treasury bills which became due at the end of the year, but the other £50,000 would be carried on to meet further indebtedness on other Treasury bills which would be falling due. This extra sum of £50,000 would not be devoted to any other purpose, as there was a clause in the Bill which specifically provided that it was only available for the payment of Treasury bills. He hoped this explanation would be satisfactory. The honorable member would find the matter fully explained in the Colonial Treasurer's financial statement, as reported in "Hansard."

The Hon. J. BRAMSTON said the explanation of the honorable member was so far satisfactory that it showed whatever money was raised in this way could only be applied to the payment of Treasury bills; but, in other respects, it did not appear to him to be strictly logical. If he understood the honorable member aright, the over-expenditure was £350,000, and there would be also £300,000 worth of Treasury bills falling due at the end of this year, for which a fresh set of Treasury bills, amounting to £350,000, were to be issued. As, however, the Bill provided in its eighth clause a safeguard, that the money so raised could be devoted to no other purpose than the payment of Treasury bills, he should make no further objection.

The House then went into committee to consider the Bill.

#### WOOGAROO LUNATIC ASYLUM.

The Hon. E. I. C. BROWNE: Honorable gentlemen, I now move that the report brought up by the select committee appointed to inquire into the management of the Woogaroo Lunatic Asylum, be adopted. It is possible that honorable members, and other persons, may have thought the committee have allowed a considerable time to elapse before bringing up their report; but when they peruse the evidence accompanying that report, and observe the number of sittings which have taken place, they will, I trust, come to the conclusion that there has been no unnecessary delay, but that the time

has been well spent. The report, in itself, is very concise, and is confined to the general recommendations of the committee; but it will be found that a great deal of evidence has been taken upon matters of detail, which will be very useful in the future management of the institution, and upon these matters of detail the committee did not consider it necessary to report. I shall confine my remarks to a few of the points in the report, to which possibly some exception may be taken, or which may not be so obvious to honorable members, as to be passed over without comment. In our first clause we state that, having found the Government had acted—not upon the report brought up by the Civil Service Commission, but upon the evidence attached to that report—and very wisely acted, because the matter was one which required instant action—the committee did not consider that it formed part of their duty—at any rate, that it was not necessary for them—to make their inquiry retrospective. The necessity for so doing ceased to exist when the Government took action in the matter, and we were not sorry, for many reasons, to be relieved from what would have been a painful and unpleasant duty. But although we have not reported upon the past management of the institution, we found it impossible to shut our eyes to the abuses which had existed; and I can only say for myself—and I believe I am only expressing the opinion of the other members of the committee—that my feeling was one of indignant astonishment at the state of things which had so long existed in connection with this institution. It is difficult to conceive how any persons holding situations of such responsibility could have been so little aware of the duty they owed to the colony, and to those unfortunate creatures placed under their charge. One of the principal causes of the defective management of the asylum has arisen from the insufficient accommodation provided by the present building. That must be patent to every person who has visited the place; and although no mention has been made of the fact in the report, I think it is due to the Colonial Architect to state;—and indeed it is quite clear from that gentleman's evidence, and the plans laid before the committee—that the building hitherto used is not the complete building designed by him, and submitted to the Government as a lunatic asylum; it merely forms a small part of the original design, being in fact that portion of it which was intended for the administrative department. It would, therefore, be extremely unfair to point to the present lunatic asylum as a proof of Mr. Tiffin's want of capacity to carry out the work he had undertaken; for it is clear that if you instruct an architect to build a house, and instead of adopting his plans, content yourself with what he intended for a kitchen, you cannot blame him for any deficiencies in the accommodation. Mr. Tiffin's plan was one which I think the Government of the day

were perfectly justified in not adopting, because it would have entailed upon the colony an outlay of some £80,000; and I think the Government would have been wrong to incur so large a liability for such a purpose. At the same time, I think they should either have asked him to modify his plans to meet the necessities of the case and the capabilities of the colony at that time, or else have rejected his plans altogether. I think it is only fair to the Colonial Architect to make these observations. In clause 11, we suggest certain additions to the building, upon what is commonly known as the cottage system—a system strongly recommended by Dr. Manning in his evidence before the committee, and also in his elaborate and valuable report to the Government of New South Wales. Honorable members who will take the trouble to peruse that report will find that this system is peculiarly adapted to the circumstances of the case. We have recommended for adoption the plans furnished by Mr. Suter in preference to those furnished by Mr. Tiffin, because they appeared to us to provide equal accommodation at a lower cost. These plans are attached to the evidence, and I believe it will be found that some little modification might have been made in the report, inasmuch as the design for the cottages proposed to be erected by Mr. Tiffin comprises a day-room for each cottage, which is not given in Mr. Suter's plan. Therefore, in saying that Mr. Suter's design provides accommodation at the rate of £18 per patient, less than Mr. Tiffin's, we have omitted to state that the latter provides for an extra room: I think it is only fair to point out this difference. In another clause—clause 5—we state that, "Your committee would, but for the very great expense which would be entailed on the colony, recommend that a new hospital, on improved principles, be erected within two or three miles of Brisbane." It was evident to every member of the committee that the best plan to be adopted would be to discard the use of the existing asylum, at least for its present purposes, and to erect an appropriate building upon a different site. But, however desirable that might be for many reasons, the committee were unable, in view of the present position of the colony, to recommend, for the present, a course which would involve such an enormous expenditure. They considered that by an extension of the accommodation, in accordance with the cottage system, they would be able to meet all present requirements. It is obvious that the cottage system which we recommend has great advantages; its initiation involves no extraordinary outlay, and the number of wards rendered necessary by the addition to the number of inmates, or for purposes of classification, can be constructed as they are required. For instance, if extra accommodation for twenty patients be required for this year, or for the next two or three years, it can be provided at once, and as the wants of the country increase

they can be supplied. This system has, moreover, been found of great advantage in the treatment of the patients. With regard to the site of the present asylum, I must confess it seemed to me extraordinary that when it was found necessary to establish an institution of this kind, those who were entrusted with the matter did not make themselves masters of the necessities of the case, and choose a more eligible spot for a lunatic asylum. As a member of the committee, I am now pretty well conversant with the requirements of such an establishment, of which, I must confess, I was previously ignorant; but I cannot help thinking that had I been asked to select a suitable site I should have made it my duty to obtain the requisite information on the subject; and if those persons who undertook the task had done so, many of the evils which have hitherto obtained might have been avoided. If that had been done it is clear that the asylum would not have been erected in its present place, where it is likely to remain for a long time. There is another clause in the report upon which I wish to make some observations, and that is clause 13, in which the committee recommend that a committee of management should be appointed to take charge of the asylum. If honorable members will read the evidence given by Dr. Manning they will see that he has given very strong reasons to show the necessity of appointing such a committee; and such a recommendation, coming from a surgeon-superintendent, who, from the position he occupies, might be presumed to entertain some jealousy towards a body of men who exercise a certain control over him, and whose duty it is to inspect his arrangements, should be entitled to considerable weight. I think the suggestion comes with great force from him, considering the very natural feeling he might be supposed to entertain. He insists upon it strongly, very strongly; and I think that in our present social position it is essential that there should be some body of men standing between the surgeon-superintendent of the institution and the Colonial Secretary. The recommendations made for the better management of the institution, or for any necessary expenditure, would come with much greater force through such a committee, than if they were made by the superintendent alone. Dr. Manning, in his evidence, states that all the American asylums are managed by committees. He says—

“I do not think it is possible to manage an asylum well without a committee, who should be entrusted with the entire management. I find it is impossible to manage an institution of this sort, properly, by directions from the Colonial Secretary's office only. All the American asylums are placed by the State under the control of a committee, consisting of from five to nine members. To them is entrusted the general management of the asylum, and at the end of each year they ask for certain funds to carry on the institution for

the following year, and these are granted or refused by the State, as may seem expedient. In addition, a sum of about four hundred pounds, for incidental expenses, is placed entirely at the disposal of the committee, for minor improvements or alterations; but they are not allowed to spend more than this sum.

“Are they generally paid directors? No; they are unpaid,” &c., &c.

He says that, although it is not invariably the case in England, yet the Home Government are recently adopting the same plan with certain asylums; but as far as I can understand there is not the same necessity for the supervision of a committee which exists here. Honorable members will see the report recommends that only one member of the proposed committee should be paid, that gentleman being a medical man. I presume that it is the practice at home to have paid medical men attached to these committees, and that the other members of the committee are gentlemen who have no profession at all, and can devote their time to the duty. Here a similar system could not well be carried out, and I do not myself see why a medical man should be paid more than any other member of the committee; because he would not be paid for his services as a medical man, but because of his loss of time; and the same argument would apply just as well to any other member of the committee, as all of them would, in all probability, be engaged in business of some sort, and be equally inconvenienced by the loss of time. I think a recommendation should have been made that no officials should be members of the committee. If the members are paid we may be sure, judging from experience, that they will be more or less under the influence of the Government, and if so, away goes at once the value of the committee. I should have been glad if we had inserted in that report, that no persons holding official situations should be so appointed, because I am sure we should not be able to expect from them that independence of action which is so necessary in cases of this kind. There is one other clause which I believe has been objected to in the other branch of the Legislature—clause 14. Although that clause has not been inserted with the slightest idea of condemning the present superintendent, Dr. Challinor, it has been alleged that there has been a desire on the part of the committee to get rid of him. I can only affirm, that no such desire has existed. We have no reason to believe that Dr. Challinor has not been acting in the best possible manner, so far as his information goes; but the question is, has he had the requisite experience? His own evidence is a sufficient answer to that question. If honorable members will turn to page 33, they will see the following questions:—

“5. Have you, in your previous practice, had much to do with cases of lunacy? No; I cannot say I have. I have had them a short time under my care, as patients.

"6. But you have not been connected with a lunatic asylum? No; those were cases of private practice."

I do not think there is a member of this House who, after reading the whole of this evidence, can fail to be convinced of the absolute necessity, for the well-being of the asylum, that the person in charge of it should have practical experience of the management of such institutions, and of the treatment of the insane. It is all very well for a medical man to read up reports on establishments of this character, and in this way to obtain a theoretical knowledge of the various systems in force in different countries. But mere theory is not sufficient; nothing but practical experience will suffice to apply that theory to peculiar cases. It is said that Dr. Challinor possesses peculiar qualifications for such an appointment, and I am perfectly ready to admit that he does possess them. He has great ability, great conscientiousness, great kindness, and, in fact, many qualifications which—if his attention had been directed to this branch of his profession some years ago—would render him particularly fitted for the post of superintendent of a lunatic asylum; but with all respect to him, I am still of opinion that clause 14 should be carried out in its integrity. It is necessary that the colony should turn over a new leaf in reference to these matters, and I believe that in order to do so it is necessary to carry out the recommendation contained in this clause. If there is anybody in the colony who can come up to the requirements of the 14th clause, then by all means let us have him; but in the absence of any person possessing the necessary qualifications, we must send home for a duly qualified superintendent. I think Dr. Challinor's own evidence is quite sufficient to show that however skilful as a medical man, he is not possessed of any experience in the treatment of the insane, as practised in the United Kingdom, and in other countries, all the improvements to which have recently been adopted. I trust the objections which may be taken to this clause will not be such as to imperil the adoption of the report; and I now formally move that it be adopted by this House.

The Hon. D. F. ROBERTS said he was not present when the honorable member, Mr. Browne, commenced his speech, but he had heard the latter portion of it, and he could not concur in the recommendation, that because Dr. Challinor had not had previous experience in the management of lunatic asylums it would be desirable to send to England for a superintendent. They all knew Dr. Challinor to be a very kind and conscientious man, and it was competent for him to do as any professional man would do whose opinion was asked upon any particular point with which he was not fully conversant, read up the practice and science of lunacy until he obtained the desired information. He did not think it would be necessary to go

to England for a superintendent; surely there were men in the colony of sufficient skill and ability to take charge of such an institution. That was the only objection to the report, which occurred to him.

The Hon. J. BRAMSTON said the clause in the report to which the honorable member, Mr. Roberts, had taken exception, was one to which he hoped the Council would give their entire support. He was convinced that the system of managing lunatic asylums in Europe—for he would not confine himself to England—was so far advanced beyond anything which as yet obtained in the colonies, that he conceived it would be impossible for any practitioner who had resided here for a number of years to administer it satisfactorily. This clause—clause fourteen of the report—had been very fully considered by the committee, and had not been adopted with any intention of casting a reflection upon Dr. Challinor; for it was the impression of the committee, and he was sure it was his own, that the appointment of that gentleman was only of a temporary character, and the clause had been framed without any reference whatever to him. He fully expected that the report would be adopted, and even if it were adopted with the omission of the 14th clause, it would be of great advantage; because the necessity of some immediate action must be apparent to every honorable member. He would only add that in his opinion, the recommendation contained in this clause was well worthy of adoption.

The POSTMASTER-GENERAL: I think the committee have been wise in declining to enter at any length into the past history of this institution. Dr. Manning has stated that, in his opinion, nothing could have been worse than the state of things which his visit to the establishment disclosed to him, and the personal inspection of the place, instituted by the committee, was quite sufficient to convince them of the necessity for immediate reform. I do not say this in order to reflect especially upon the officers of the institution, or the Colonial Secretary, in whose department it was placed. There can be no doubt that the whole subject has been neglected; it has not been sufficiently understood, and public attention has not been directed to it. I do not mean to say that there has been any wilful neglect on the part of the officials connected with the establishment. The real fact is, that it has been treated more as a prison than as a hospital for the insane; and the main object appears to have been to keep the patients in the institution, instead of curing them as soon as possible, and freeing the country from the cost of their maintenance. The system has been a very defective one, and it has arisen in a great measure from the fact, that no attention has been directed to the subject; and until the Civil Service Commission brought up their report and evidence the public had no idea that the scenes which occurred in the asylum were taking place.

I think no one will deny that the evidence given by Dr. Manning is of a very valuable character. The report which that gentleman furnished to the New South Wales Government was in the hands of the committee; and although that report gives the fullest details in reference to the modern system adopted in England, on the Continent, and America, for the treatment of the insane, and is in every respect a very valuable and interesting document, the committee derived the greatest advantage from the *visd voce* testimony of that gentleman, based as it was upon his personal inspection of the institution, especially in all matters of detail. I have, no doubt, that most of Dr. Manning's suggestions will be carried out; and no one, I am sure, will be more ready to give effect to them than the present acting superintendent, Dr. Challinor. I strongly concur in the opinion of the committee, that the present site is extremely inconvenient, and in my opinion it is desirable under all circumstances, and at all hazards, to bring it nearer to some centre of population, as there can be no doubt, that the whole tone of its management would be greatly altered for the better. And here I must take exception to one paragraph in the report, in which reference is made to the financial condition of the country. I do not think a committee appointed for a specific purpose—to inquire into the management of a lunatic asylum—should refer to the finances of the colony. Their duty was to report upon the institution, without reference to cost; because the report of this committee will, no doubt, at some future time, be of great interest, as the result of a very important inquiry; and it would have been better, in my opinion, if the committee had simply expressed their opinion, that it was desirable to commence the erection of a lunatic asylum in some locality more suitable than the present: the evidence is conclusive upon that point. The whole result of Dr. Manning's inquiry as to the management of institutions of this sort in England, America, and other countries, is in favor of placing them within easy access of some considerable town. Dr. Manning admits that the hospital for the insane, at Gladesville, of which he has charge, labors under a great disadvantage in consequence of its distance from town. Now, we all know that it is not so many miles from Sydney, and that the facilities of communication in that colony are much greater than here; still, he affirms that the distance is a great impediment to his management of the institution; and I therefore submit that it would have been desirable to have had some decided recommendation from the committee that, as soon as circumstances would permit, a new asylum should be commenced in the vicinity of the city, and that even now a suitable site should be selected for that purpose. It is well known that lunatics cannot be provided for without a very considerable expenditure, and, according to the evidence

before the committee, hospitals of this character cannot be constructed at a less cost than about one hundred pounds per patient. This is an expenditure we shall have to undertake some time or other, and it would, I think, have been as well to make some recommendation on the subject. It is apparent that a considerable expenditure will be required for the cottages suggested by the committee; and the whole evidence goes to show that, although the cottage system is, perhaps, the most desirable to adopt under present circumstances, it is, in reality, the most expensive; and I believe that if we had to commence again *de novo*, with three hundred or four hundred patients to provide for, it would be better, with a view to concentration, to erect a complete building for the purpose, than to put up a number of cottages scattered over a large extent of ground. I am therefore decidedly of opinion that the safest step in this direction would be to provide a hospital for female patients alone—to commence a new hospital altogether. The evidence shows that the accommodation for females, in the present asylum, is especially insufficient, and that some immediate steps are necessary to improve it; and I think, therefore, it would be wise to fix upon a new site, and to take steps, as soon as possible, to provide a new building where, in time, the whole of the patients may be accommodated. If the site were nearer Brisbane, so as to be within the reach of medical supervision, it would not be necessary, for the present, to appoint another superintendent, and the present surgeon-superintendent could continue to take charge of the establishment at Woogaroo. The distance of that establishment from the city is unquestionably a disadvantage: it does not invite the attendance of friends of the patients, or visitors who might otherwise take an interest in the institution. Some few persons, who have plenty of leisure, will continue their visits; but there is ample evidence to show that an asylum cannot be effectively managed unless it be within easy access of the committee of management and the public generally. Some comment has been made on the eleventh paragraph of the report, and the relative merits of Mr. Tiffin and Mr. Suter's plans have been brought into question. I have heard it stated that Mr. Suter had made use of some influence which he possessed with the committee, in order to induce them to report in his favor. I believe there is not the slightest foundation for such a statement. The recommendations of the committee were founded upon Dr. Manning's evidence, and their own personal inspection of the place. It is not at all derogatory to Mr. Tiffin that Mr. Suter's plans were considered somewhat preferable to his. I believe Mr. Suter has devoted a good deal of attention to this particular branch of his profession, and Dr. Manning, in his evidence, especially refers to this when he says "that Mr. Suter's

plans appear to have caught the spirit of modern invention." I observe, too, Dr. Manning particularly recommends that before any step is taken either to enlarge the present buildings, or to erect a new one, reference should be made to the very elaborate plans in the Colonial Architect's office, in Sydney, which embody all the latest improvements to be found in institutions of this character in England and America, as furnished by Dr. Manning himself. I think it is desirable to adopt the recommendation to erect wooden buildings, but they cannot be looked upon as permanent structures. I am satisfied that they may be put up at about one-third the cost of stone buildings; still they can only be considered temporary erections, and we must expect to supply their places with substantial structures of stone or brick. With regard to the appointment of a managing committee, no doubt it is a difficult question; but it will become still more difficult if the asylum is to continue at Woogaroo: it will be found difficult to secure the attendance of unpaid members, and that is another argument in favor of bringing the asylum within easy access of town, so that voluntary inspection may be given to it. Under these circumstances, therefore, I think that for the present the sole responsibility of management ought to rest with the Colonial Secretary and the members of this House; but that as soon as we are in a position to erect a building in the vicinity of a population, and under the surveillance of an unpaid committee, by all means let such a committee be appointed. It is no use to have a nominal committee who will not do their work; and I am confident that we shall not find an efficient committee to inspect the asylum, in its present position, unless we pay them for their services. Then as to clause fourteen, I think that in many respects Dr. Challinor is a very suitable person for the post he occupies. It is quite true that he was only appointed temporarily to the office; but I am quite sure that no one could have discharged his duties in a more humane, conscientious, or disinterested manner than he has done. Still, he may possess all these qualities, and it may be our duty in the interest of these poor creatures to attempt, at any rate, to secure for them greater practical experience in the treatment of the insane than he is possessed of. We might, it is true, send to England, and get a very accomplished and experienced man who might come out here as superintendent, and yet, for some reason or other, he might not be so suitable or so useful as Dr. Challinor, who admits that he has had little or no experience in this branch of his profession. If, on the other hand, we can succeed in securing the services of a gentleman who, in addition to a large amount of experience, possesses the humane and kind-hearted qualities which characterise Dr. Challinor, we shall best serve the interests of the colony, and the wants of these poor people for whom

we have to provide. It is, no doubt, a very difficult matter. Perhaps, it may be met in this way—It is well known that there are several asylums in the colonies, where the treatment of the patients is nearly as good as in the best asylums in England. For instance, I presume that Dr. Manning, with his experience and successful treatment, has, by this time, brought the establishment at Gladesville nearly up to the standard of English institutions. If he has not, it has been not from the want of ability, but because he has not had the requisite means at his command. Well, then, we know that the Yarra Bend Asylum, in Victoria, has lately been reorganized, and that an experienced practitioner has been sent out from England to take charge of it; and we are told by Dr. Manning that the system of management there is very complete. Now, if Dr. Challinor, with his undoubted qualifications in other respects, could have an opportunity of inspecting the working of these institutions, it might not be necessary to send to England for a superintendent. Dr. Manning, it appears, had little or no previous experience in the treatment of the insane, although it is true that he had given a great deal of attention to the subject—so much so, that the Government of New South Wales considered it desirable to send him home to England, where, no doubt, he had an opportunity of obtaining a larger experience than Dr. Challinor would, if we were to send him to Melbourne or Sydney. But I submit that if Dr. Manning gained his experience by going to England for it, it would be quite possible for another person to do the same thing. I take no exception to the wording of the report. It affirms—what is undoubtedly the case—that it is very desirable—and, no doubt, it is our duty—to obtain, at almost any cost, the very best management; and here I will direct the attention of honorable members to an answer given by Dr. Manning to a question put to him, by me, in page 51—

"38. Could you get a man of experience from England for £600 a year? Yes; I think so. I think you might get one of the assistant medical officers from one of the large asylums at home.

"39. What salaries would such officers be receiving at home? From £100 to £150 a year.

"40. *By the Chairman:* With board and lodging? Yes; and attendance and everything of that sort.

"41. *By the Hon. J. Douglas:* Such officers, I suppose, are generally young men in the profession? They are generally young men looking for promotion in the asylums at home; they are usually men from twenty-six to thirty-five years of age."

It will, therefore, be seen that we could only expect to get a young man, probably of good parts and promise, holding the situation of assistant-surgeon in one of the asylums at home. His experience would not be very large; and although it might be superior to Dr. Challinor's, it by no means follows that



we should find in him a suitable superintendent; it would only be an experiment. Dr. Manning tells us that, in South Australia, the Government sent home for a superintendent; but the gentleman who came out only remained in the colony a short time, from some cause or other. I believe the climate did not agree with him. All these things should be taken into consideration; and there is a good deal to be said on both sides of the question. The honorable member who moved the adoption of the report said that the evidence brought up with it will be of great service hereafter; and there can be no doubt that the evidence of Dr. Manning, and his report to the Government of New South Wales, which the committee had before them, embrace a great deal of valuable information. And although we are not in a position to spend £80,000 or £100,000 in the erection of a new building, it is satisfactory to know that things have been placed on a much better basis; and I hope the Government will be encouraged to do their duty in connection with this subject, by the expression of opinion which will go forth from the Legislature; and that they, on their part, will not shrink from taking whatever steps may be necessary to the progress and welfare of the institution.

The Hon. F. E. BIGGE said there was one point in the honorable member's speech in which he could not agree with him. After having gone to the expense of erecting the necessary buildings at Woogaroo, he thought it would be folly to abandon them on account of the site. He had been in Tasmania lately, and had visited the lunatic asylum there, which was situated fully twenty-five miles from the capital; and even at that distance it was so managed as to have the reputation of being the best lunatic asylum in the colonies. It was visited monthly by three paid commissioners; and, as far as he could judge, the arrangements were very efficiently carried out. He could not see, therefore, why this colony should be put to the expense of erecting a separate building. He agreed with the honorable member that the committee should be paid, as he felt sure that no gentlemen would be found to undertake, voluntarily, duties of that character.

The PRESIDENT said that before the debate closed he wished to make a few remarks. He would confine himself to that portion of the report which referred to the site of the present asylum. Honorable members, who had addressed themselves to that question, appeared to have forgotten that it would not be very long before there was a railway between Brisbane and Ipswich, which must pass through Woogaroo. The asylum would then be within half-an-hour of the metropolis, which was certainly not too much to prevent the visits of a committee of management, or of that portion of the public who interested themselves in this institution. He was also of opinion that the committee should consist

of paid members, and he presumed that was intended by the report. The duty devolving upon that committee would be a very onerous and unpleasant one, more so than honorable members were perhaps aware of before this inquiry was instituted. He thought the members of the hospital committee, who would be entrusted with the management of the establishment, should be persons who were conversant with the subject, and would take an interest in it; and to obtain the services of such persons, the public must expect to pay for them. Gratuitous services were seldom well performed, and it was very desirable that efficient men should be found to undertake the task of inspection. There was only one other portion of the report to which he would allude, as he had not had time to read the whole of the evidence. He could not help feeling that the late surgeon-superintendent had just grounds for complaint, and that his case had been hardly dealt with. That gentleman might possibly have been unfitted for the appointment, but a good deal of the evil complained of was attributable to the defective nature of the buildings. To carry out a proper system of management was a very difficult matter; and, if the colony declined to go to the expense of increasing the accommodation, he thought it was hardly fair to lay all the blame upon the officer in charge.

The Hon. E. I. C. BROWNE, in reply, said, that if the system of-paid commissioners was resorted to again, he felt quite certain it would be just as well to have no committee at all. It was evident, from Dr. Manning's evidence, that it was essentially desirable to have an independent body of men entrusted with the management of the institution to stand between the surgeon-superintendent and his immediate superior, the Colonial Secretary. If the members of the committee were paid servants of the Government, they would have no weight in enforcing their recommendations upon the Government. The committee of management, at Gladesville, consisted of from five to nine members, and not one of them was paid. He thought it was quite possible to find the same number of gentlemen in this colony who would undertake the duty, without reward; but, if not, in his opinion, it would be better to have no committee at all: the great object in appointing a committee of management being to have some counterbalance to the power of the Government, which could only be done by securing the voluntary services of thoroughly independent men. It was extremely to be regretted, that the honorable the Postmaster-General, who had taken exception to portions of the report, and was, himself, a member of the committee, had not been present and expressed his opinions when the committee considered their report, as he might then have had an opportunity of moving any amendments he desired.

The Hon. W. THORNTON rose to address the House.

The Hon. E. I. C. BROWNE pointed out that it was not competent for the honorable member to address the House, after he had spoken in reply.

The PRESIDENT said, the honorable member was not out of order in addressing the House ; but, it was not usual for an honorable member to speak, after the mover of the question before the House had spoken in reply.

The question was then put and passed.